The Greater Good Gratitude Summit
Gratitude in Verse

Poetry by Dennis Kim, Youth Speaks
Challenges to Gratitude
And How to Overcome Them

Panelists: Tom Gilovich, Amie Gordon & Alex Wood;
discussion joined by Robert Emmons

Moderator: Jason Marsh
Two Enemies of Gratitude

Presentation by
Tom Gilovich
Professor, Cornell University
Enemy #1
The Headwinds/Tailwinds Asymmetry
Who is held to a higher standard?

1  2  3  4  5  6  7  8  9
Younger  6  7  8  9  Older

5.75  7.08
When it comes to Presidential Elections, does the Electoral College favor Democratic or Republican candidates?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Favors</strong></td>
<td><strong>Democratic Candidates</strong></td>
<td>3.16</td>
<td><strong>Favors</strong></td>
<td><strong>Republican Candidates</strong></td>
<td>4.35</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Enemy #2

The Remarkable Power of Adaptation
One Solution to Two Problems
"I should have bought more crap."
What makes a better (experiential) story?

A tale of a strong headwind
or
A tale of a strong tailwind
• Cornell students asked to indicate their most significant experiential OR material purchase in the past 5 years

• Then asked how often they’ve talked about their purchase from 1 (Not At All) to 9 (Quite a Bit)

• Also asked how much they would talk about the purchase (Also a 1-9 scale)
How Often *Have* You Talked Your Purchase?

How *Inclined* Would You Be to Talk about Your Purchase?
Ratings of how much participants enjoyed a conversation (and their conversation partner) on the topic of material possessions or experiences.

Enjoyed Conversation? | Liked Partner?
---|---
Material | Experiential

- Experience of enjoyment with material possessions: [Rating]
- Experience of enjoyment with experiential experiences: [Rating]

Material possessions: [Rating] > Experiential experiences: [Rating]
What is more resistant to habituation?

A good experience
or
A good material possession
Why do experiences combat habituation more effectively than possessions?

- They yield more and better stories
- They become a bigger part of who we are
- They connect us more to others
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Purchase</th>
<th>Experiential</th>
<th>Material</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>How happy does it make you?</td>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>6.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How much has contributed to your happiness?</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>5.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Was it money well spent?</td>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>6.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How grateful are for having it?</td>
<td>7.8</td>
<td>7.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Randomly selected 150 reviews from each of Tripadvisor Hotels, Tripadvisor restaurants, Yelp arts and entertainment, Yelp hotels and travel

Randomly selected 150 reviews from each of CNET televisions, CNET laptops, Amazon furniture, Amazon clothing
1 = no gratitude
2 = suggestive of gratitude
3 = clearly grateful
Amount Given to Other Participant in the Dictator Game

- Material: $2.00
- Control: $3.50
- Experiential: $4.00
Gratitude with Discernment: A Strategy for a Balanced Research Field

Alex M. Wood, PhD

Professor and Director, Behaviour Science Centre
Stirling Management School, University of Stirling

Honorary Professor, School of Psychological Sciences, University of Manchester
It is a great pleasure to be here today, in my normal capacity as a grumpy Scot.

Those who know me, will know that I’m a reluctant convert to believing that gratitude is important to mental health or can be meaningfully increased to improve well-being.

I’ve mentioned this before in talks.

**This time I’m going to go further, arguing:**
- Introduction (gratitude isn’t always a good thing)
- The field of gratitude research is discrediting itself in the minds of some people by failing to engage meaningfully in exploring the construct holistically, including when it is “bad”.
- Need for philosophical study.
- Need for theoretical psychological study.
- Need for applied study.

(This was the picture that came up when I Google Image searched “grumpy Scottish. Almost all of the results were also cats.)
Is gratitude good?

Let us look at this through the lens of is gratitude a virtue:
What then is a virtue?

One of the earliest surviving and still most authoritative treatment of virtues was provided by Aristotle in his “Nicomachean Ethics”.

Characteristics were deemed as potentially virtuous based on cultural acceptance of “excellence” in humanity.

Virtue is the situational appropriate mid-point between two equally as non-virtuous (lit. “vicious”) extremes on these characteristic.

Thus, for example;

Bravery is a continuum from cowardice (vicious) to situationally appropriate displays (virtue) to foolhardiness (vicious)

Modesty is a continuum from brazenness (vicious) to situationally appropriate displays (virtue) to self-effacement (vicious)

No characteristic is good or bad, it depends on the fit between the experience/display and the situation. Therefore, the virtue requires correctly reading situations (“discernment”) and acting accordingly. Too much or inappropriate expression of a characteristic is as vicious as too little.
Many people and cultures do NOT think that gratitude is good or virtuous

“When it comes to life the critical thing is whether you take things for granted or take them with gratitude”

Gilbert K. Chesterton

“Gratitude is an illness suffered by dogs”

Joseph Stalin

• Both views are both right if Stalin refers to the vicious extreme of gratitude, and Chesterton the situationally appropriate mid-point.

• Gratitude is the situationally appropriate mid-point between two equally as vicious extremes:

Ingratitude (vicious) to situationally appropriate feelings and displays (virtuous) to inappropriate gratitude (vicious).

(When I Googled “Stalin dog” I actually got a dog that supposedly looks like Stalin.)
Who’s this?

(Also from the Pups that Look like Dictators website)
If Gratitude is the situationally appropriate mid-point between two equally as bad extremes, then we have a problem/challenge:

• The field has taken the rather more simplistic view that “more gratitude is good”.
  
  • This is true, but only for those below the situational appropriate mid-point; for those above the mid-point more gratitude is bad.
  
  • In some ways this hasn’t been problematic (why the robust correlations between gratitude and well-being have emerged), because most people are globally below rather above that point.
  
• However, it is a huge problem, because:
  
  • Many people do not think gratitude is desirable. This is not a rare/pathological belief; it is the most prevalent in cultures such as the UK, and in many fields of psychology.
    • In the eyes of such people, the gratitude research (and researchers) discredit themselves by only focusing on the positive, appearing cultish, and not being able to answer very legitimate philosophical counterpoints (which can be just dismissed/ignored)
  
  • As with most fields of research, most people have selected into gratitude research as the research is personally relevant for them; great, but more effort is needed to be balanced.
• Whilst few people globally feel too much gratitude, it is likely very common that misplaced gratitude occurs, on which the field of “gratitude” research has little to say.
  
• To do more than simply convince those who want to be convinced about gratitude, and ensure we are scientists not evangelacists, the field needs to develop in a more balanced manner and study when and where gratitude is good, when bad. Where might we start?
Philosophical

In the recent Jubilee Centre gratitude conference (in Birmingham, UK), philosophers raised some key concerns:

• “Thank you for letting me pee” (Claudia Card); real stories of highly abused people who felt gratitude towards their abusers on the rare occasions their abuse was less extreme (cf. Stolholm syndrome).

• The “non-identity problem” (Saul Smilansky); to be here now, every event in history has to have happened – is, then, to express gratitude for existence to express gratitude that every atrocity in history happened?

• The “slave forman problem”; a slave is treated kindly and thus feels gratitude to someone who admittedly didn’t have to be kind, but who’s very existence is a cog in a wheel that perpetuates the inequity.
Psychological

• Virtually no work, but an interesting doctoral dissertation out of National University of Singapore showing that following a gratitude induction, people are more likely to persist in doing a task that is inherently abusive (continually filling in a questionnaire with clearly no purpose or explanation).

• One dissertation; really?? We risk falling into the very problem that positive psychology criticised “old psychology” for doing; only focusing on half of experience.

• What kind of co-occurring appraisals or situations make state gratitude unhelpful?

• When are their non-linear relationships between trait gratitude and outcomes?

• What kind of situations does trait and state gratitude interact with to make the experience worse (cf. conscientiousness)?
• Gratitude, like any intervention, has a wide range of responses: Most people improve, relative to control (sometimes), but many get worse.

• Who are these people? Is this simple error in measurement, unrelated fluxuation, or is it something about the intervention interacting with the person of their situation?

• People often say; “but aren't gratitude interventions making people less realistic about life”.
  • I don’t believe this, but rather it encourages people to see the good alongside the bad (and compare to automatic thought records, where the negative thoughts are “challenged”). But I have no evidence of this.

• Are there some ways in which gratitude interventions are presented that make people feel that they should feel gratitude, thus making their lives seem more unbearable if they don’t feel gratitude (cf., Barbra Held “Tyranny of Happiness in the USA”; greater suicides in happier countries).

• How might “gratitude interventions” already being maliciously used?
  • To what extent does marketing manipulate feelings of gratitude to promote undesirable behaviour?
Conclusion

• It is not my intention to be critical of gratitude, nor the field of gratitude research (which I helped create).

• Indeed, since starting researching, rather against my expectations, my data has shown me that for most people, most of the time more gratitude would be a good thing (including, and especially, me personally).

• But nothing is good, all of the time, in all settings.

• As scientists, we want to understand when and for whom it is good and when and for whom it is bad: Gratitude with discernment.

• If we can do this, then we can convince the sceptical people who dismiss gratitude, through presenting a balanced, nuanced argument, which is robust to criticism (if that is what the evidence ultimately says).

• I believe that the application of gratitude research has gone nearly as far as it can go on its current path; it has already convinced most of the people who want to be convinced, but done little for those for whom gratitude isn’t part of their identity.

• I offer another way forward which ensures that gratitude research remains scientific and sceptical.
Thank You

(Possibly)
The “Don’ts” of Practicing Gratitude

Presentation by
AMIE GORDON, PhD
Postdoctoral Scholar, UC Berkeley
A “Thank You” a day keeps the doctor away

There are times when gratitude might be the wrong prescription.
Research on gratitude has focused on:
• Main effects
• Benefits

We also need to consider that in certain situations, or for certain people, gratitude might have negative consequences
5 Examples of the “Don’ts” of Practicing Gratitude
1. Don’t overdose on gratitude
Practicing gratitude too often might make you feel less happy

- 3x versus 1x per week
- Long list versus short list

Sheldon & Lyubomirsky, 2006
I am grateful for...

1. ________________________________
2. ________________________________
3. ________________________________
4. ________________________________
5. ________________________________
6. ________________________________
7. ________________________________
8. ________________________________
9. ________________________________
10. ________________________________
11. ________________________________
12. ________________________________
13. ________________________________
14. ________________________________
15. ________________________________
16. ________________________________
17. ________________________________
18. ________________________________
19. ________________________________
20. ________________________________
2. Don’t let it prevent you from recognizing your own effort and value
Gratitude helps us see how others played a role in our successes...

But attributing success entirely to others may prevent you from recognizing your own value and hard work

Wood, Heimpel, Newby-Clark, & Ross, 2005
Gratitude for others is good.

But gratitude in the extreme, “I’m so lucky to have you, I don’t deserve you,” might mask insecurities.
3. Don’t apply it to the wrong person
In a healthy relationship, gratitude promotes commitment

In an unhealthy relationship, might it do the same?

Gordon, Impett, Kogan, Oveis, & Keltner, 2012
4. Don’t use it to avoid dealing with serious problems
For minor issues, a focus on positivity can be beneficial.

But for severe problems, sometimes anger is needed to motivate change.

e.g., McNulty & Russell, 2010; Overall et al., 2009
5. Don’t let power dynamics get in the way
People higher in power see help from others as a way of incurring favor.

- More cynical attributions
- Less likely to feel thankful

Inesi, Galinsky, & Gruenfeld, 2012
Gratitude has many benefits, but it’s not a panacea

Err on the side of being grateful, but practice it mindfully
The Greater Good Gratitude Summit
Grateful Athletes

With Teri McKeever, Coach of the 2012 U.S. Olympics Women’s Swimming Team
How to Cultivate Gratitude: Strategies for Home, School, and Work

Panelists: Andrea Hussong, Sara Algoe, Giacomo Bono, & Chris Murchison

Moderator: Robert Emmons
RAISING GRATEFUL CHILDREN

Presentation by
Andrea Hussong
Director, Center for Developmental Science
University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill
With thanks for the 118 families who participated in our studies and to the Greater Good Science Center and Templeton Foundation who provided funding for this work.
What is gratitude in young children?
What Parents Mean by Gratitude in Children

Raising Grateful Children (Hussong, PI)
Process Model for Children’s Gratitude

Look at what Aunt Dottie gave you!

Awareness

Attributions

Positive Affect

Behavior

Initial Step

Meaning Making

Expression

Raising Grateful Children (Hussong, PI)
Process Model for Children’s Gratitude

Oh wasn’t that kind! She did not have to do that.

Awareness

Initial Step

Attributions

Meaning Making

Positive Affect

Expression

Behavior

Raising Grateful Children (Hussong, PI)
Process Model for Children’s Gratitude

- **Awareness**
- **Attributions**
- **Positive Affect**
- **Behavior**

*Initial Step*  
*Meaning Making*  
*Expression*

She must think you are special. Doesn’t that feel good?

Raising Grateful Children (Hussong, PI)
What does it look like when parents interact with their children around the gratitude process?
What do parents do on a day-to-day basis to encourage gratitude in children?
Does practicing gratitude predict how children are doing one month later?
Children show “good manners” more often than other forms of gratitude. Within the gratitude process, children are least likely to make gratitude-enhancing attributions about gifts received.
Children show “good manners” more often than other forms of gratitude. Within the gratitude process, children are least likely to make gratitude-enhancing attributions about gifts received.

Parents spend more time reinforcing “good manners” than in any other form of parenting that encourages gratitude experiences in children.

Raising Grateful Children (Hussong, PI)
Advice to Parents

Encourage parents to think about gratitude in their children as more than showing good manners.

Think about developing gratitude as a process that begins by being aware of the gifts you receive.

Raising Grateful Children (Hussong, PI)
Gratitude in Romantic Relationships

Presentation by
Sara B. Algoe, Ph.D.
Assistant Professor of Psychology, UNC-Chapel Hill
Reminds and binds (Algoe, 2012)
Adaptation
Everyday Gratitude as a “Booster Shot”
“Unpacking the mechanisms”

- What makes an expression so impactful?

- Extent of effects on each member
  - Behavior, evaluations, biological
1. Notice your partner’s actions

Principle: Create your own opportunity to capitalize on gratitude’s nature
2. Don’t forget to show it

*Principle: Missed connections don’t count (as much)*
3. Be genuine

*Principle: Gratitude operates at this wavelength*
Everyday gratitude combats adaptation
...and promotes growths

algoe@unc.edu
How to Cultivate Gratitude: Strategies for Schools

Presentation by
Giacomo Bono, PhD.
California State University
Youth Gratitude Project (YGP)

- Measurement Research
- Basic Research with Children
- Intervention Research (Curriculum)
- Longitudinal Research with Adolescents
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A lot like me</th>
<th>Sort of like me</th>
<th>Sort of like me</th>
<th>A lot like me</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Some kids don’t see much to be thankful for.</td>
<td>BUT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Some kids are grateful to only a few people.</td>
<td>BUT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Some kids almost never feel grateful.</td>
<td>BUT</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
YGP: Qualitative Study of Generosity & Appreciation in Children (5 to 10 year olds)
• 5-6 yrs: Helping injured friend*, Sharing food*, Protecting, Helping clean up, Returning things
YGP: Qualitative Study cont.

- 7-8 yrs: Sharing personal items, Helping learn a skill or activity (game or sport), Helping with school assignments
YGP: Qualitative Study cont.

- 8-10 yrs: Encouragement, Emotional support (girls), Social inclusion (boys)
YGP: Qualitative Study cont.

• Two Patterns emerged:
  • Appreciation mentioned less than generosity
  • More overlap between appreciation & generosity themes with age
“OTHER PEOPLE MATTER”
– CHRIS PETERSON
YGP: Gratitude Curriculum

1. Introduction
2. Personal meaning/value of a benefit or gift
3. Cost to benefactor
4. Benefactors’ intentions
5. Review/summary
YGP: Curriculum Intervention

- Why do people feel grateful?
Grateful Thinking

![Graph showing the increase in Grateful Thinking over weeks for attention control and intervention condition](attachment:grateful_Thinking_graph.png)
Grateful Feeling

![Graph showing the change in gratitude over weeks for two conditions: attention control and intervention condition. The intervention condition shows an increase in gratitude over weeks, while the attention control condition shows a decrease.](image-url)
Positive Affect

![Graph showing positive affect over weeks with two lines: one for attention and one for intervention condition.](image-url)
Students in the curriculum wrote 80% more thank-you cards to the PTA than controls.
YGP: Longitudinal Research with Adolescents

- Ages 10-14 at start of study
- 54% girls
- 67% White, 11% Asian, 10% Black, 1.4% Hispanic, 9% other
- Parents’ college edu (2-10 yrs)
Do girls have the moral upper hand?

- Girls were also more prosocial & grateful
- Boys were more antisocial earlier

### Table 1. Gratitude IQ by Gender

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Gratitude @ Yr 1</th>
<th>Gratitude @ Yr 4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Boys</td>
<td>97.60</td>
<td>97.91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Girls</td>
<td>102.04</td>
<td>101.73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T-tests</td>
<td>t = 3.12</td>
<td>t = 2.63</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
YGP Conclusions: Strategies

✓ Encourage empathy & thoughtfulness with friends
✓ Train benefit appraisals to appreciate & thank others
✓ Practice kindness, esp. boys
✓ Use strengths to contribute to community, esp. girls
CULTIVATING GRATITUDE IN THE WORKPLACE

Presentation by
CHRIS MURCHISON
VP for Staff Development & Culture | HopeLab
Workplaces hold the promise and possibility to support the expression of our full humanness.
Gratitude is a core practice of being human.
Yet, people are less likely to feel or express gratitude at work than anyplace else.
Most people feel better when they thank someone at work, yet surprisingly only a small number do this regularly.
People are also eager to be thanked and appreciated, particularly by their bosses.
Given this, how do we cultivate gratitude in the workplace?
Here are some ways that gratitude can fertilize the workplace soil...
A duckling waddles
Before it feathers and flies
Try, fail, learn and grow

#HaikuHope
Values-based appreciation
Honoring
Beginnings
Check-Ins
Endings
Understanding gratitude at work as...

- A Practice
- Caring
- Moments of Positivity
- An Act of Generosity
- An Act of Intimacy
“At the end of the day people won't remember what you said or did, they will remember how you made them feel.”

- Maya Angelou
The Greater Good Gratitude Summit
StoryCorps: Voices of Gratitude

Như Tiến Lưu, Geraldine Ah Sue & Frank Kingman
Making Gratitude Go Viral: Strategies for Global Change

Panelists: Anthony Chavez, Nipun Mehta, Peter Jin Hong, Jeremy Adam Smith, & Brother David Steindl-Rast

Moderator: Dacher Keltner
Thnx4.org

Presentation by
Jeremy Adam Smith
Editor & Producer, Greater Good Science Center
My co-workers are great & good!
But I need some work.

How do you make a guy like me more thankful?
Well, I need reminders
And I need proof
That’s what Thnx4.org provides!

Thnx4 is a sharable gratitude journal—and it’s a scientific tool for understanding what happens when people say “thank you.”

If you complete the three-week gratitude challenge, you’ll learn how saying “thnx!” changed your life and you’ll add to the growing body of research on gratitude’s physical and psychological benefits.

Start →
An email reminds you to say thnx

I felt grateful

or

I made someone grateful
You check in about your day

If your day was a cake, what three ingredients would you put in it?

- awful
- awesome
- boring
- exciting
- lonely
- tiresome
- spontaneous
- quiet
- angry
- happy

- happy
- awesome
- boring
- exciting
- lonely
- tiresome
- spontaneous
- quiet
- angry
- happy
You can read your journal.

**My Journal**

- Apr 17 @ 2:33pm
  - I felt grateful for someone.
  - Who was it?
  - Family member
  - What did this person do for you?
  - My mom booked a vacation for the whole family, including my partner.

- Apr 16 @ 1:57pm
  - I felt grateful for someone.
  - Who was it?
  - Stranger
  - What did this person do for you?
  - He took me around his neighborhood to help me find a new apartment.

- Nov 9 @ 4:09pm
  - I felt grateful for someone.
  - Who was it?
  - Family member
  - What did this person do for you?
  - Spent time listening, took me out to eat, supported me.
This gives us the proof!

• Saying thnx does put you in a good mood

• It makes you happier

• You experience fewer tummy aches, headaches, coughs, etc.
What have we learned?

• Any emotion beats no emotion
• Positive emotions beat negative ones
• Problem-solving beats big ideas
• Modeling beats telling or yelling
• Priming beats cringing
If I can become more thankful, anyone can
Greater Good Science Center

http://greatergood.berkeley.edu/
Virality of Compassion

Presentation by

Peter Jin Hong
Sr. Designer, Social Impact, Google
Thank you!

You did good.
Spread the love.
Discover your trends

Flex comes with free online tools and a mobile app that allow you to set goals and follow your progress through awesome graphs and charts.

Log food, workouts and much more and get the inside scoop on your health. Knowing how close you are to reaching your goals gives you the motivation to reach them and aim higher.
Change Yourself, Change the World

We believe in the inherent generosity of others and aim to ignite that spirit of service. Through our small, collective acts, we hope to transform ourselves and the world.
THANK YOU!

Closing Remarks from Dacher Keltner
The Greater Good Gratitude Summit